# ADMINISTRATIVE ORDER OF THE CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE OF THE COURTS

Pursuant to the authority vested in me, and with the advice and consent of the Administrative Board of the Courts, I hereby amend, effective January 17, 2006, Part 202 of the Uniform Civil Rules of the Supreme and County Courts, to add the attached new section 202.70, relating to the Commercial Division of the Supreme Court.

Shief Administrative Judge of the Courts

Dated: December 29, 2005

AO/518 /05

# §202.70 Rules of the Commercial Division of the Supreme Court

# (a) Monetary thresholds

Except as set forth in subdivision (b), the monetary thresholds of the Commercial Division, exclusive of punitive damages, interests, costs, disbursements and counsel fees claimed, is established as follows:

Albany County	\$25,000
Erie County	\$25,000
Kings County	\$50,000
Nassau County	\$75,000
New York County	\$100,000
Queens County	\$50,000
Seventh Judicial District	\$25,000
Suffolk County	\$25,000
Westchester County	\$100,000

#### (b) Commercial cases

Actions in which the principal claims involve or consist of the following will be heard in the Commercial Division provided that the monetary threshold is met or equitable or declaratory relief is sought:

(1) Breach of contract or fiduciary duty, fraud, misrepresentation, business tort (e.g., unfair competition), or statutory and/or common law violation where the breach or violation is alleged to arise out of business dealings (e.g., sales of assets or securities; corporate restructuring; partnership, shareholder, joint venture, and other business agreements; trade secrets; restrictive covenants;

- and employment agreements not including claims that principally involve alleged discriminatory practices);
- (2) Transactions governed by the Uniform Commercial Code (exclusive of those concerning individual cooperative or condominium units);
- (3) Transactions involving commercial real property, including Yellowstone injunctions and excluding actions for the payment of rent only;
- (4) Shareholder derivative actions -- without consideration of the monetary threshold;
- (5) Commercial class actions -- without consideration of the monetary threshold;
- (6) Business transactions involving or arising out of dealings with commercial banks and other financial institutions;
- (7) Internal affairs of business organizations;
- (8) Malpractice by accountants or actuaries, and legal malpractice arising out of representation in commercial matters;
- (9) Environmental insurance coverage;
- (10) Commercial insurance coverage (e.g. directors and officers, errors and omissions, and business interruption coverage);
- (11) Dissolution of corporations, partnerships, limited liability companies, limited liability partnerships and joint ventures -- without consideration of the monetary threshold; and
- (12) Applications to stay or compel arbitration and affirm or disaffirm arbitration awards and related injunctive relief pursuant to CPLR Article 75 involving any of the foregoing enumerated commercial issues -- without consideration of the monetary threshold.

#### (c) Non-commercial cases

The following will not be heard in the Commercial Division even if the monetary threshold is met:

- (1) Suits to collect professional fees;
- (2) Cases seeking a declaratory judgment as to insurance coverage for personal injury or property damage;
- (3) Residential real estate disputes, including landlord-tenant matters, and commercial real estate disputes involving the payment of rent only;
- (4) Proceedings to enforce a judgment regardless of the nature of the underlying case;
- (5) First-party insurance claims and actions by insurers to collect premiums or rescind non-commercial policies; and
- (6) Attorney malpractice actions except as otherwise provided in paragraph (b)(8).

## (d) Assignment to the Commercial Division

- (1) A party seeking assignment of a case to the Commercial Division shall indicate on the Request for Judicial Intervention (RJI) that the case is "commercial." A party seeking a designation of a special proceeding as a commercial case shall check the "other commercial" box on the RJI, not the "special proceedings" box.
- (2) The party shall submit with the RJI a brief signed statement justifying the Commercial Division designation, together with a copy of the proceedings.

#### (e) Transfer into the Commercial Division

If a case is assigned to a non-commercial part because the filing party did not designate the case as "commercial" on the RJI, any other party may apply by letter application (with a copy to all parties) to the Administrative Judge, within ten days after receipt of a copy of the RJI, for a transfer of the case into the Commercial Division. The determination of the Administrative Judge shall be final and subject to no further administrative review or appeal.

## (f) Transfer from the Commercial Division

- (1) In the discretion of the Commercial Division justice assigned, if a case does not fall within the jurisdiction of the Commercial Division as set forth in this section, it shall be transferred to a non-commercial part of the court.
- (2) Any party aggrieved by a transfer of a case to a non-commercial part may seek review by letter application (with a copy to all parties) to the Administrative Judge within ten days of receipt of the designation of the case to a non-commercial part. The determination of the Administrative Judge shall be final and subject to no further administrative review or appeal.

#### (g) Rules of practice for the Commercial Division

Unless these rules of practice for the Commercial Division provide specifically to the contrary, the rules of Part 202 also shall apply to the Commercial Division, except that Rules 7 through 15 shall supersede section 202.12 (Preliminary Conference) and Rules 16 through 24 shall supersede section 202.8 (Motion Procedure).

Rule 1. Appearance by Counsel with Knowledge and Authority. Counsel who appear in the Commercial Division must be fully familiar with the case in regard to which they appear and fully authorized to enter into agreements, both substantive and procedural, on behalf of their clients. Counsel should also be prepared to discuss any motions that have been submitted and are outstanding. Failure to comply with this rule may be regarded as a default and dealt with appropriately. See Rule 12. It is important that counsel be on time for all scheduled appearances.

Rule 2. Settlements and Discontinuances. If an action is settled, discontinued, or otherwise disposed of, counsel shall immediately inform the court by submission of a copy of the stipulation or a letter directed to the clerk of the part along with notice to chambers via telephone or e-mail. This notification shall be made in addition to the filing of a stipulation with the County Clerk.

Rule 3. Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR). At any stage of the matter, the court may direct or counsel may seek the appointment of an uncompensated mediator for the purpose of mediating a resolution of all or some of the issues presented in the litigation.

#### Rule 4. Electronic Submission of Papers.

- (a) Papers and correspondence by fax. Papers and correspondence filed by fax should comply with the requirements of section 202.5-a except that papers shall not be submitted to the court by fax without advance approval of the justice assigned. Correspondence sent by fax should not be followed by hard copy unless requested.
- (b) Papers submitted in digital format. In cases not pending in the court's Filing by Electronic Means System, the court may permit counsel to communicate with the court and each other by e-mail. In the court's discretion, counsel may be requested to submit memoranda of law by e-mail or on a computer disk along with an original and courtesy copy.
- Rule 5. (This rule shall apply only in the First and Second Judicial Departments) Information on Cases. Information on future court appearances can be found at the court system's future appearance site (www.nycourts.gov/ecourts). Decisions can be found on the Commercial Division home page of the Unified Court System's internet website: www.courts.state.ny.us/comdiv or in the New York Law Journal. The clerk of the part can also provide information about scheduling in the part (trials, conferences, and arguments on motions). Where circumstances require exceptional notice, it will be furnished directly by chambers.
- Rule 6. Form of Papers. All papers submitted to the Commercial Division shall comply with CPLR 2101 and section 202.5(a). Papers shall be double-spaced and contain print no smaller than twelve-point, or  $8\frac{1}{2} \times 11$  inch paper, bearing margins no smaller than one inch. The print size of footnotes shall be no smaller than ten-point. Papers also shall comply with Part 130 of the Rules of the Chief Administrator.
- Rule 7. Preliminary Conference; Request. A preliminary conference shall be held within 45 days of assignment of the case to a Commercial Division justice, or as soon thereafter as is practicable. Except for good cause shown, no preliminary conference shall be adjourned more than once or for more than 30 days. If a Request for Judicial Intervention is accompanied by a dispositive motion, the preliminary conference shall take place within 30 days following the decision of such motion (if not rendered moot) or at

such earlier date as scheduled by the justice presiding. Notice of the preliminary conference date will be sent by the court at least five days prior thereto.

## Rule 8. Consultation prior to Preliminary and Compliance Conferences.

- (a) Counsel for all parties shall consult prior to a preliminary or compliance conference about (i) resolution of the case, in whole or in part; (ii) discovery and any other issues to be discussed at the conference; and (iii) the use of alternate dispute resolution to resolve all or some issues in the litigation. Counsel shall make a good faith effort to reach agreement on these matters in advance of the conference.
- (b) Prior to the preliminary conference, counsel shall confer with regard to anticipated electronic discovery issues. Such issues shall be addressed with the court at the preliminary conference and shall include but not be limited to (i) implementation of a data preservation plan; (ii) identification of relevant data; (iii) the scope, extent and form of production; (iv) anticipated cost of data recovery and proposed initial allocation of such cost; (v) disclosure of the programs and manner in which the data is maintained; (vi) identification of computer system(s) utilized; (vii) identification of the individual(s) responsible for data preservation; (viii) confidentiality and privilege issues; and (ix) designation of experts.

# Rule 9. (Reserved)

Rule 10. Submission of Information. At the preliminary conference, counsel shall be prepared to furnish the court with the following: (i) a complete caption, including the index number; (ii) the name, address, telephone number, e-mail address and fax number of all counsel; (iii) the dates the action was commenced and issue joined; (iv) a statement as to what motions, if any, are anticipated; and (v) copies of any decisions previously rendered in the case.

#### Rule 11. Discovery

(a) The preliminary conference will result in the issuance by the court of a preliminary conference order. Where appropriate, the order will contain specific provisions for means of early disposition of the case, such as (i) directions for submission to the alternative dispute resolution program; (ii) a schedule of limited-issue discovery in aid of early dispositive motions or settlement; and/or (iii) a schedule for dispositive motions before disclosure or after limited-issue disclosure.

- (b) The order will also contain a comprehensive disclosure schedule, including dates for the service of third-party pleadings, discovery, motion practice, a compliance conference, if needed, a date for filing the note of issue, a date for a pre-trial conference and a trial date.
- (c) The preliminary conference order may provide for such limitations of interrogatories and other discovery as may be necessary to the circumstances of the case.
- (d) The court will determine, upon application of counsel, whether discovery will be stayed, pursuant to CPLR 3214(b), pending the determination of any dispositive motion.
- Rule 12. Non-Appearance at Conference. The failure of counsel to appear for a conference may result in a sanction authorized by section 130.2.1 of the Rules of the Chief Administrator or section 202.27, including dismissal, the striking of an answer, an inquest or direction for judgment, or other appropriate sanction.

# Rule 13. Adherence to Discovery Schedule

- (a) Parties shall strictly comply with discovery obligations by the dates set forth in all case scheduling orders. Such deadlines, however, may be modified upon the consent of all parties, provided that all discovery shall be completed by the discovery cutoff date set forth in the preliminary conference order. Applications for extension of a discovery deadline shall be made as soon as practicable and prior to the expiration of such deadline. Non-compliance with such an order may result in the imposition of an appropriate sanction against that party pursuant to CPLR 3126.
- (b) If a party seeks documents as a condition precedent to a deposition and the documents are not produced by the date fixed, the party seeking disclosure may ask the court to preclude the non-producing party from introducing such demanded documents at trial.
- Rule 14. Disclosure Disputes. Counsel must consult with one another in a good faith effort to resolve all disputes about disclosure. See section 202.7. Except as provided in Rule 24 hereof, if counsel are unable to resolve any disclosure dispute in this fashion, the aggrieved party shall contact the court to arrange a conference as soon as practicable to avoid exceeding the discovery cutoff date. Counsel should request a conference by telephone if that would be more convenient and efficient than an appearance in court.

Rule 15. Adjournments of Conferences. Adjournments on consent are permitted with the approval of the court for good cause where notice of the request is given to all parties. Adjournment of a conference will not change any subsequent date in the preliminary conference order, unless otherwise directed by the court.

#### Rule 16. Motions in General.

- (a) Form of Motion Papers. The movant shall specify in the notice of motion, order to show cause, and in a concluding section of a memorandum of law, the exact relief sought. Counsel must attach copies of all pleadings and other documents as required by the CPLR and as necessary for an informed decision on the motion (especially on motions pursuant to CPLR 3211 and 3212). Counsel should use tabs when submitting papers containing exhibits. Copies must be legible. If a document to be annexed to an affidavit or affirmation is voluminous and only discrete portions are relevant to the motion, counsel shall attach excerpts and submit the full exhibit separately. Documents in a foreign language shall be properly translated. CPLR 2101(b). Whenever reliance is placed upon a decision or other authority not readily available to the court, a copy of the case or of pertinent portions of the authority shall be submitted with the motion papers.
- (b) Proposed Orders. When appropriate, proposed orders should be submitted with motions, e.g., motions to be relieved, pro hac vice admissions, open commissions, etc. No proposed order should be submitted with motion papers on a dispositive motion.
- (c) Adjournment of Motions. Dispositive motions (made pursuant to CPLR 3211, 3212 or 3213) may be adjourned only with the court's consent. Non-dispositive motions may be adjourned on consent no more than three times for a total of no more than 60 days unless otherwise directed by the court.
- Rule 17. Length of Papers. Unless otherwise permitted by the court: (i) briefs or memoranda of law shall be limited to 25 pages each; (ii) reply memoranda shall be no more than 15 pages and shall not contain any arguments that do not respond or relate to those made in the memoranda in chief; (iii) affidavits and affirmations shall be limited to 25 pages each.
- Rule 18. Sur-Reply and Post-Submission Papers. Absent express permission in advance, sur-reply papers, including correspondence, addressing the merits of a motion are not permitted, except that counsel may inform the court by letter of the citation of any post-submission court decision that is relevant to the pending issues, but there shall be no additional argument. Materials submitted in violation hereof will not be read or

considered. Opposing counsel who receives a copy of materials submitted in violation of this Rule shall not respond in kind.

Rule 19. Orders to Show Cause. Motions shall be brought on by order to show cause only when there is genuine urgency (e.g., applications for provisional relief), a stay is required or a statute mandates so proceeding. See Rule 20. Absent advance permission, reply papers shall not be submitted on orders to show cause.

## Rule 19-a. Motions for Summary Judgment; Statements of Material Facts.

- (a) Upon any motion for summary judgment, other than a motion made pursuant to CPLR 3213, the court may direct that there shall be annexed to the notice of motion a separate, short and concise statement, in numbered paragraphs, of the material facts as to which the moving party contends there is no genuine issue to be tried.
- (b). In such a case, the papers opposing a motion for summary judgment shall include a correspondingly numbered paragraph responding to each numbered paragraph in the statement of the moving party and, if necessary, additional paragraphs containing a separate short and concise statement of the material facts as to which it is contended that there exists a genuine issue to be tried.
- (c) Each numbered paragraph in the statement of material facts required to be served by the moving party will be deemed to be admitted for purposes of the motion unless specifically controverted by a correspondingly numbered paragraph in the statement required to be served by the opposing party.
- (d) Each statement of material fact by the movant or opponent pursuant to subdivision (a) or (b), including each statement controverting any statement of material fact, must be followed by citation to evidence submitted in support of or in opposition to the motion.
- Rule 20. Temporary Restraining Orders. Unless the moving party can demonstrate that there will be significant prejudice by reason of giving notice, a temporary restraining order will not be issued. The applicant must give notice to the opposing parties sufficient to permit them an opportunity to appear and contest the application.
- Rule 21. Courtesy Copies. Courtesy copies should not be submitted unless requested or as herein provided. However, courtesy copies of all motion papers and proposed orders shall be submitted in cases in the court's Filing by Electronic Means System.

- Rule 22. Oral Argument. Any party may request oral argument on the face of its papers or in an accompanying letter. Except in cases before justices who require oral argument on all motions, the court will determine, on a case-by-case basis, whether oral argument will be heard and, if so, when counsel shall appear. Notice of the date selected by the court shall be given, if practicable, at least 14 days before the scheduled oral argument. At that time, counsel shall be prepared to argue the motion, discuss resolution of the issue(s) presented and/or schedule a trial or hearing.
- Rule 23. 60-Day Rule. If 60 days have elapsed after a motion has been finally submitted or oral argument held, whichever was later, and no decision has been issued by the court, counsel for the movant shall send the court a letter alerting it to this fact with copies to all parties to the motion.

#### Rule 24. Advance Notice of Motions

- (a) Nothing in this rule shall be construed to prevent or limit counsel from making any motion deemed appropriate to best represent a party's interests. However, in order to permit the court the opportunity to resolve issues before motion practice ensues, and to control its calendar in the context of the discovery and trial schedule, pre-motion conferences in accordance herewith must be held. The failure of counsel to comply with this rule may result in the motion being held in abeyance until the court has an opportunity to conference the matter.
- (b) This rule shall not apply to disclosure disputes covered by Rule 14 nor to dispositive motions pursuant to CPLR 3211, 3212 or 3213 made at the time of the filing of the Request for Judicial Intervention or after discovery is complete. Nor shall the rule apply to motions to be relieved as counsel, for pro hac vice admission, for reargument or in limine.
- (c) Prior to the making or filing of a motion, counsel for the moving party shall advise the Court in writing (no more than two pages) on notice to opposing counsel outlining the issue(s) in dispute and requesting a telephone conference. If a cross-motion is contemplated, a similar motion notice letter shall be forwarded to the court and counsel. Such correspondence shall not be considered by the court in reaching its decision on the merits of the motion.
- (d) Upon review of the motion notice letter, the court will schedule a telephone or in-court conference with counsel. Counsel fully familiar with the matter and with authority to bind their client must be available to participate in the conference. The

unavailability of counsel for the scheduled conference, except for good cause shown, may result in granting of the application without opposition and/or the imposition of sanctions.

- (e) If the matter can be resolved during the conference, an order consistent with such resolution may be issued or counsel will be directed to forward a letter confirming the resolution to be "so ordered." At the discretion of the court, the conference may be held on the record.
- (f) If the matter cannot be resolved, the parties shall set a briefing schedule for the motion which shall be approved by the court. Except for good cause shown, the failure to comply with the briefing schedule may result in the submission of the motion unopposed or the dismissal of the motion, as may be appropriate.
- (g) On the face of all notices of motion and orders to show cause, there shall be a statement that there has been compliance with this rule.
- (h) Where a motion must be made within a certain time pursuant to the CPLR, the submission of a motion notice letter, as provided in subdivision (a), within the prescribed time shall be deemed the timely making of the motion. This subdivision shall not be construed to extend any jurisdictional limitations period.
- Rule 25. Trial Schedule. Counsel are expected to be ready to proceed either to select a jury or to begin presentation of proof on the scheduled trial date. Once a trial date is set, counsel shall immediately determine the availability of witnesses. If, for any reason, counsel are not prepared to proceed on the scheduled date, the court is to be notified within ten days of the date on which counsel are given the trial date or, in extraordinary circumstances, as soon as reasonably practicable. Failure of counsel to provide such notification will be deemed a waiver of any application to adjourn the trial because of the unavailability of a witness. Witnesses are to be scheduled so that trials proceed without interruption. Trials shall commence each court day promptly at such times as the court directs. Failure of counsel to attend the trial at the time scheduled without good cause shall constitute a waiver of the right of that attorney and his or her client to participate in the trial for the period of counsel's absence. There shall be no adjournment of a trial except for good cause shown. With respect to trials scheduled more than 60 days in advance, section 125.1(g) of the Rules of the Chief Administrator shall apply and the actual engagement of trial counsel in another matter will not be recognized as an acceptable basis for an adjournment of the trial.
- Rule 26. Estimated Length of Trial. At least ten days prior to trial or such other time as the court may set, the parties, after considering the expected testimony of and, if

necessary, consulting with their witnesses, shall furnish the court with a realistic estimate of the length of the trial.

- Rule 27. Motions in Limine. The parties shall make all motions in limine no later than ten days prior to the scheduled pre-trial conference date, and the motions shall be returnable on the date of the pre-trial conference, unless otherwise directed by the court.
- Rule 28. Pre-Marking of Exhibits. Counsel for the parties shall consult prior to the pre-trial conference and shall in good faith attempt to agree upon the exhibits that will be offered into evidence without objection. At the pre-trial conference date, each side shall then mark its exhibits into evidence as to those to which no objection has been made. All exhibits not consented to shall be marked for identification only. If the trial exhibits are voluminous, counsel shall consult the clerk of the part for guidance. The court will rule upon the objections to the contested exhibits at the earliest possible time. Exhibits not previously demanded which are to be used solely for credibility or rebuttal need not be pre-marked.
- Rule 29. Identification of Deposition Testimony. Counsel for the parties shall consult prior to trial and shall in good faith attempt to agree upon the portions of deposition testimony to be offered into evidence without objection. The parties shall delete from the testimony to be read questions and answers that are irrelevant to the point for which the deposition testimony is offered. Each party shall prepare a list of deposition testimony to be offered by it as to which objection has not been made and, identified separately, a list of deposition testimony as to which objection has been made. At least ten days prior to trial or such other time as the court may set, each party shall submit its list to the court and other counsel, together with a copy of the portions of the deposition testimony as to which objection has been made. The court will rule upon the objections at the earliest possible time after consultation with counsel.

#### Rule 30. Settlement and Pretrial Conferences.

(a) Settlement Conference. At the time of certification of the matter as ready for trial or at any time after the discovery cut-off date, the court may schedule a settlement conference which shall be attended by counsel and the parties, who are expected to be fully prepared to discuss the settlement of the matter.

(b) Pre-trial Conference. Prior to the pretrial conference, counsel shall confer in a good faith effort to identify matters not in contention, resolve disputed questions without need for court intervention and further discuss settlement of the case. At the pre-trial conference, counsel shall be prepared to discuss all matters as to which there is disagreement between the parties, including those identified in Rules 27-29, and settlement of the matter. At or before the pre-trial conference, the court may require the parties to prepare a written stipulation of undisputed facts.

# Rule 31. Pre-Trial Memoranda, Exhibit Book and Requests for Jury Instructions

- (a) Counsel shall submit pre-trial memoranda at the pre-trial conference, or such other time as the court may set. Counsel shall comply with CPLR 2103(e). A single memorandum no longer than 25 pages shall be submitted by each side. No memoranda in response shall be submitted.
- (b) At the pre-trial conference or at such other time as the court may set, counsel shall submit an indexed binder or notebook of trial exhibits for the court's use. A copy for each attorney on trial and the originals in a similar binder or notebook for the witnesses shall be prepared and submitted. Plaintiff's exhibits shall be numerically tabbed and defendant's exhibits shall be tabbed alphabetically.
- (c) Where the trial is by jury, counsel shall, on the pre-trial conference date or such other time as the court may set, provide the court with case-specific requests to charge and proposed jury interrogatories. Where the requested charge is from the New York Pattern Jury Instructions Civil, a reference to the PJI number will suffice. Submissions should be by hard copy and disk or e-mail attachment in WordPerfect 12 format, as directed by the court.
- Rule 32. Scheduling of witnesses. At the pre-trial conference or at such time as the court may direct, each party shall identify in writing for the court the witnesses it intends to call, the order in which they shall testify and the estimated length of their testimony, and shall provide a copy of such witness list to opposing counsel. Counsel shall separately identify for the court only a list of the witnesses who may be called solely for rebuttal or with regard to credibility.
- Rule 33. Preclusion. Failure to comply with Rules 28, 29, 31 and 32 may result in preclusion pursuant to CPLR 3126.